

## **EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES**

**Committee:** Area Planning Subcommittee   **Date:** 7 November 2007  
South

**Place:** Roding Valley High School, Brook Road, Loughton, Essex   **Time:** 7.30 - 9.12 pm

**Members Present:** J Hart (Chairman), Mrs L Wagland (Vice-Chairman), K Angold-Stephens, K Chana, R Church, Mrs S Clapp, T Frankland, Mrs A Haigh, J Knapman, R Law, J Markham, Mrs C Pond, B Sandler, P Turpin and H Ulkun

**Other Councillors:**

**Apologies:** D Bateman, M Cohen, G Mohindra, Mrs P Richardson and P Spencer

**Officers Present:** N Richardson (Principal Planning Officer) and A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer)

### **41. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION**

The Chairman welcomed members of the public to the meeting and outlined the procedures and arrangements agreed by the Council, to enable persons to address the Sub-Committee in relation to the determination of applications for planning permission.

### **42. MINUTES**

#### **RESOLVED:**

That the minutes of the last meeting held on 10 October 2007 be taken as read and signed by the Chairman as a correct record subject to noting that the paragraph on item 1 (EPF/1824/07, page 15 of the agenda) repeated itself.

### **43. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

(a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor J Markham, declared a personal interest in agenda items 6(14) (EPF/1876/07, 126 High Road, Loughton) by virtue of being a member of the Loughton Residents Association. The Councillor declared that his interest was not prejudicial and indicated that he would stay in the meeting during the consideration and voting on the items.

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors K Angold – Stephens and Mrs C Pond declared personal interests in agenda items 6 (2) (EPF/1968/07, 9 The Summit, Loughton), (11) (EPF/2032/07, 28 Forest View Road, Loughton), (12) (EPF/1733/07, 94a High Road, Loughton), (13) (EPF/1843/07, Forest

House, Nursery Road, Loughton), (14) (EPF/1876/07, 126 High Road, Loughton) and (15) (EPF/1979/07, 18 Clifton Road, Loughton) by virtue of being members of Loughton Town Council and the Loughton Residents Association. The Councillors declared that their interests were not prejudicial and indicated that they would stay in the meeting during the consideration and voting on the items.

(c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors Chana, Sandler, Knapman and Mrs Wagland declared personal interests in agenda items 6 (7) (EPF/1077/07, Land East of Limes Farm, Community Hall, Limes Avenue, Chigwell), (8) (EPF/1902/07, 12 Whitehall Close, Chigwell) and (10) (EPF/1974/07, 13 Audleigh Place, Chigwell) by virtue of being members of Chigwell Town Council. The Councillors declared that their interests were not prejudicial and indicated that they would stay in the meeting during the consideration and voting on the items.

(d) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors Church and Ulkun declared personal interests in agenda items 6 (1) (EPF/1914/07, Highway Verge, Opp Nos. 19-27 Palace Gardens, Buckhurst Hill), (3) (EPF/1887/07, 107-111 Epping New Road, Buckhurst Hill), (4) (EPF/1930/07, 29 Walnut Way, Buckhurst Hill) and (5) (EPF/1999/07 4 The Stables, Buckhurst Hill) by virtue of being members of Buckhurst Hill Parish Council. The Councillors declared that their interests were not prejudicial and indicated that they would stay in the meeting during the consideration and voting on the items.

#### **44. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

It was reported that there was no urgent business for consideration at the meeting.

#### **45. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL**

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

##### **RESOLVED:**

That the planning applications numbered 1 – 15 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

#### **46. SIX-MONTH REVIEW OF OPERATION OF SUBCOMMITTEE**

The Sub-committee noted the six month report on the review of the operation of the new Area Plans Sub-committee South meeting. The meeting noted the table analysing the meeting statistics for the last six months and how they compared to the previous Plans A meetings.

##### **RESOLVED:**

That the sub-committee noted the six month report reviewing the operation of the new arrangements for Plans Sub-committee South.

#### **47. PROBITY IN PLANNING – APPEAL DECISIONS, APRIL TO SEPT 2007.**

In compliance with the recommendations of the District Auditor, the Sub – Committee received a report advising of the outcome of all successful appeals, particularly those refused contrary to officer recommendation. The purpose was to advise of the

consequence of these decision and inform of cases where costs could be awarded against the Council.

It was noted that the Best Value Performance Indicator was for district councils to aim to have less than 40% of their decisions overturned on appeal with the national average of about 33%. That BVPI was scrapped but recently replaced by one which records planning appeals only (not advertisement, listed buildings, enforcements, telecommunications or tree related appeals) and where the Council sets its own target – set this year at 25%, equivalent to the top quartile performance. In fact in recent years the Council has been more successful than the national average with only 18% in 2003/04, 29% in 2004/05 and 22% in 2005/06.

Over the six-month period between April and September 2007, the Council received 54 decisions on appeals – 47 planning and related appeals and 7 enforcement appeals. Of the 47 planning and related appeals, 11 were allowed (23%) and none of the 7 enforcement appeals – a combined total of 20.3% of the Council's decisions being overturned.

For the BVPI, which only considers appeals against the refusal of planning permission (so does not include advertisement, listed building, enforcement, telecommunications or tree-related appeals, nor appeals against conditions), the performance figure was 20.5% - within target and one of the top quarter performing authorities.

**RESOLVED:**

That the Planning Appeals Decisions for April to September 2007 be noted.

**48. DELEGATED DECISIONS**

The Sub-Committee noted that schedules of planning applications determined by the Head of Planning and Economic Development under delegated authority since the last meeting had been circulated and could be inspected at the Civic Offices.

**CHAIRMAN**

This page is intentionally left blank

**Report Item no. 1**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1914/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	Highway Verge Opp. Nos. 19-27 Palace Gardens Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9
<b>PARISH:</b>	Buckhurst Hill
<b>WARD:</b>	Buckhurst Hill West
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	TPO/EPF/06/88/A1: T1 Hornbeam; Fell.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Refuse Permission

**REASON FOR REFUSAL**

- 1 Insufficient reasons have been provided to justify the loss of the subject preserved tree and, in the absence of this information, the proposal is contrary to policy LL9 of the Council's Adopted Local Plan and Alterations..

**Report Item no. 2**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1968/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	9 The Summit Loughton Essex IG10 1SW
<b>PARISH:</b>	Loughton
<b>WARD:</b>	Loughton St Johns
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	TPO/05/93 - T1 Scots Pine - fell.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Refuse Permission

**REASON FOR REFUSAL**

- 1 Insufficient justification has been submitted as reasons for felling the tree that proves the necessity of felling the tree and, in the absence of this information, the proposal is contrary to policy LL9 of the Council's Adopted Local Plan and Alterations..

**Report Item no. 3**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1887/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	107-111 Epping New Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9
<b>PARISH:</b>	Buckhurst Hill
<b>WARD:</b>	Buckhurst Hill West
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Demolition of existing building and erection of a block of 8 flats
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Details of the types and colours of the external finishes shall be submitted for approval by the Local Planning Authority in writing prior to the commencement of the development, and the development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.
- 3 No development hereby approved shall take place until measures to enable the provision of highway improvements to the local area, necessitated by this development, are secured.
- 4 Prior to the commencement of development details of screen walls, fences or such similar structures shall be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, and shall be erected before the occupation of any of the dwellings hereby approved and maintained in the agreed positions.
- 5 Before the commencement of the development or any works on site, details of the landscaping of the site, including retention of trees and other natural features, shall be submitted in writing for the approval of the Local Planning Authority, and shall be carried out as approved.
- 6 Prior to the commencement of the development details of the proposed surface materials for the parking area shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The agreed surface treatment shall be completed prior to the first occupation of the development.
- 7 Before work commences on site, details of security gates to serve the rear car parking area shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The agreed details shall be provided on site before first occupation of the flats hereby approved and retained thereafter.

- 8 Notwithstanding the details shown on the submitted plan (drawing no. 824/1a), details of parking and the forecourt layout shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to work commencing on site. The details shall show two parking spaces, an agreed turning area and soft landscaping in the forecourt area, with six spaces at the rear of the proposed building, as agreed shall be carried out prior to the first occupation of the flats hereby approved and remain as agreed thereafter.
- 9 Before work commences on site, details of secure cycle parking shall be submitted and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The details as agreed shall be provided before first occupation of the flats and retained thereafter.
- 10 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations (which includes deliveries and other commercial vehicles to and from the site) shall only take place on site between the hours of 0730 to 1830 Monday to Friday & 0800 to 1300 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 11 Wheel washing or other cleaning facilities for vehicles leaving the site during demolition and construction works shall be installed in accordance with details which shall be submitted and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The facilities shall be installed prior to commencement of any works on the site and shall be used to clean vehicles leaving the site.
- 12 Prior to commencement of the development a full noise survey should be carried out to establish which noise category the proposed plots fall into with regard to the guidance in PPG24: Planning and Noise. Following the survey, a scheme for protecting the proposed new dwellings from noise, shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority for any dwellings, gardens and recreation areas that fall into NEC B and C or above, as detailed in PPG 24. All works, which form part of the scheme, shall be completed before any of the proposed residential development is occupied.
- 13 Other than as shown on the approved plan, there shall be no living rooms on the rear elevation of the proposed building at first and second floor level at any time.



**Report Item no. 4**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1930/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	29 Walnut Way Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 6HU
<b>PARISH:</b>	Buckhurst Hill
<b>WARD:</b>	Buckhurst Hill East
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Demolition of detached garage and erection of a single storey side and rear extension. (Revised application)
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed extension, shall match those of the existing building.
- 3 Notwithstanding the provision of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 1995 (or of any equivalent provisions of any Statutory Instrument revoking or re-enacting the Order) no windows other than any shown on the approved plan shall be formed at any time in the flank walls of the building hereby permitted without the prior written approval of the Local Planning Authority.

**Report Item no. 5**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1999/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	4 The Stables Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5RQ
<b>PARISH:</b>	Buckhurst Hill
<b>WARD:</b>	Buckhurst Hill West
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Two storey side and rear extensions.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Refuse Permission

**REASONS FOR REFUSAL**

- 1 The proposal will result in loss of amenity to the occupants of 3 The Stables by reason of the bulky, dominant and overbearing scale of the extension and perceived overlooking from new windows on the side elevation, contrary to policy DBE9 of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations.
- 2 The proposed extension of this large scale and massing would be over-dominant and out of keeping with the character of this mews and harm the symmetry of this well designed group of houses, contrary to policy DBE1 and DBE10 of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

**Report Item no. 6**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/2000/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	37 Roebuck Lane Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5QN
<b>PARISH:</b>	Buckhurst Hill
<b>WARD:</b>	Buckhurst Hill West
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	First floor side and rear extension, part single storey rear extension.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed extension, shall match those of the existing building.
- 3 Notwithstanding the provision of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 1995 (or of any equivalent provisions of any Statutory Instrument revoking or re-enacting that Order) no enclosure or balcony shall be formed at any time on any part of the roof of the development hereby approved without the prior written approval of the Local Planning Authority.

**Report Item No: 7**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1077/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	Land to east of Limes Farm Community Hall, Limes Avenue Chigwell Essex
<b>PARISH:</b>	Chigwell
<b>WARD:</b>	Grange Hill
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	To retain existing 'drop in centre'.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission

**NO CONDITIONS**

**Report Item no. 8**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1902/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	12 Whitehall Close Chigwell Essex IG7 6EQ
<b>PARISH:</b>	Chigwell
<b>WARD:</b>	Chigwell Row
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Side dormer window to second floor.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Prior to first occupation of the building hereby approved the proposed window openings in side dormer window shall be fitted with obscured glass and have fixed frames, and shall be permanently retained in that condition.
- 3 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed extension, shall match those of the existing building.

**Report Item No. 9**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1964/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	Garden Centre 212, Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 4JX
<b>PARISH:</b>	Chigwell
<b>WARD:</b>	Grange Hill
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Outline application for proposed development of 22 no. 2 bed flats, 2 no. 1 bed flats and 1 no. 3 bed flat plus car parking.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Item Withdrawn – Planning application withdrawn by applicant's agent.

**Report Item no. 10**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1974/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	13 Audleigh Place Chigwell Essex IG7 5QT
<b>PARISH:</b>	Chigwell
<b>WARD:</b>	Grange Hill
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Electrically operated sliding gate and fixed fence to front of house.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 The proposed fence and hinged gate hereby approved shall not exceed 2m in height, and the proposed electronically operated sliding gate hereby approved shall not exceed 2.3m in height.

**Report Item no. 11**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/2032/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	28 Forest View Road Loughton Essex IG10 4DY
<b>PARISH:</b>	Loughton
<b>WARD:</b>	Loughton Forest
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Retention of rear roof dormer window.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission

**NO CONDITIONS**



**Report Item no. 12**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1733/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	94A High Road Loughton Essex IG10 4HT
<b>PARISH:</b>	Loughton
<b>WARD:</b>	Loughton Forest
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Change of use from residential to office.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Prior to the occupation of the dwelling hereby approved, details of sound proofing measures to be carried out when the building is converted shall be submitted to the local planning authority for approval in writing. The conversion shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

**Report Item no. 13**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1843/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	Forest House Nursery Road Loughton Essex IG10 4EA
<b>PARISH:</b>	Loughton
<b>WARD:</b>	Loughton Forest
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Loft conversion with dormer windows and hip to gable extension, change of roofing material to existing porch, alterations to ground floor bay windows.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed extension, shall match those of the existing building.
- 3 Prior to first occupation of the extension hereby approved the proposed window opening in the rear dormer window shall be fitted with obscured glass and have fixed frames, and shall be permanently retained in that condition.
- 4 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 1995 as amended (or any other order revoking, further amending or re-enacting that order) no development generally permitted by virtue of Part 1, Class B shall be undertaken without the prior written permission of the Local Planning Authority.

**Report Item no.14**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1876/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	126 High Road Loughton Essex IG10 4BE
<b>PARISH:</b>	Loughton
<b>WARD:</b>	Loughton Forest
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	First floor extension to restaurant.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Refuse Permission

**REASONS FOR REFUSAL**

- 1 The design of the proposed extension would be out of keeping and harmful to the main building and the street scene, contrary to policy DBE1 and 2 of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

**Report Item no. 15**

<b>APPLICATION No:</b>	EPF/1979/07
<b>SITE ADDRESS:</b>	18 Clifton Road Loughton Essex IG10 1EA
<b>PARISH:</b>	Loughton
<b>WARD:</b>	Loughton St Marys
<b>DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:</b>	Single storey side extension.
<b>DECISION:</b>	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

**CONDITIONS**

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed extension, shall match those of the existing building.
- 3 Notwithstanding the provision of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 1995 (or of any equivalent provisions of any Statutory Instrument revoking or re-enacting the Order) no windows other than any shown on the approved plan shall be formed at any time in the flank walls of the building hereby permitted without the prior written approval of the Local Planning Authority.